

**REALM Evaluation Guide for Judges**

**Middle School**

<b>Criteria</b> Literary (A, B, C) Design and Graphics (D, E)	<b>Merit (0-70)</b>	<b>Excellent (71-85)</b>	<b>Superior (86-100), Nominated for REALM First Class (93-100)</b>	<b>REALM First Class* (93-100)</b>
<b>A. Content and Quality:</b> includes originality, variety, strength of ideas and themes. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Effective language, clarity, precision, expressiveness, sophistication, rhythm, musicality apt for middle school.</li> <li>● Masterful use of literary devices (i.e. metaphor, image, symbol).</li> <li>● Exploration of genres (drama, wit, fantasy, thought) and literary forms (varieties of verse, prose narrative, dialogue, essay) to express themes</li> </ul>	Some good writing, but quality may be inconsistent. Less variety of students represented. Subject matter may lack sophistication and may become repetitive at times. (0-38 points)	High-quality writing. Variety of students represented. Sophistication of writing still present and subject matter prevalent. (39-42 points)	Outstanding writing. Writing by a wide variety of students represented. Subject matter avoids becoming trite. High quality writing for middle school level. (43-50 points)	Outstanding writing. Writing by a wide variety of students represented. Masterful use of literary devices and broad exploration of genres.
<b>B. Rhetorical Variety:</b> Poetry, narrative fiction, dramatic dialogue, personal essay, nonfiction writing (from across the curriculum), translations, multimedia presentations (song lyrics, links to original student music, film, performance online)	Limited to 1 to 3 genres. Writing from one or two other subject areas may be included. (0-10 points)	Some genres (at least 4 distinct) represented. Writing from some other subject areas included. (11-13 points)	Many genres (at least 5 distinct) represented. Writing from multiple subject areas included. (14-15 points)	Broad representation of genres (5+) and subject matter included.
<b>C. Editing and Proofreading</b>	Adequate editing but noticeable errors distract from writing. Students have minor role in process. (0-10 points)	Strong editing. Minimal errors. Students have strong role in the editing process. (11-13 points)	Meticulous editing. Error-free. Students dominate the editing process. (14-15 points)	Meticulous editing and proofreading.
<b>D. Artistic Quality:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Overall artistic quality.</li> <li>● Effective use of art and design to complement writing.</li> <li>● Effective layout and typography.</li> <li>● Students dominate graphics.</li> </ul>	Simplistic layout. Design/ graphics lack quality. Lacking coherence of theme/design. (0-10 points)	Attractive design. Art and design connect to writing. Students have strong role. (11-13 points)	Unifying design, high-quality graphics, coherence of theme/design. (14-15 points)	Unifying design, high-quality graphics. Clear theme, coherent design.
<b>E. Front Matter, Credits, and Pagination:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Legible and informative front matter (Table of Contents...).</li> <li>● Title page (title, school, city, district, state, date).</li> <li>● Staff credits, contact information</li> </ul>	Incomplete and lacking information. Design may be cluttered or confusing. Students have a weak role. (0-2 points)	Complete, accurate, and clear. Students have a notable role. (3-4 points)	Complete, accurate, and well-designed. Students strong role in the process. (5 points)	Complete information, correct pagination. Well-designed.

**\*REALM FIRST CLASS: Superior magazines may move up to REALM First Class, depending on the national rankings at the annual convention**

Note: This special award (REALM First Class) recognizes magazines that fulfill extraordinary standards of excellence. The magazine is characterized by a variety of genres including print and multimedia presentations, highly original and technically outstanding writing, high quality design with fonts and graphics that complement the theme and tone, inclusion of high-quality writings from various disciplines, and other evidence that school-wide participation has gone into the development of the magazine. In such magazines, students handle virtually all aspects of writing, production, and business with exceptional skill. The REALM advisory committee selects this award at the NCTE Annual Convention. The REALM First Class honor may be given to several magazines in a particular year.