

REALM Evaluation Guide for Judges

Middle School

Criteria Writing (A, B, C) Art (D, E) Graphic Design and Layout (F) Editing/Proofreading (G) Publication Conventions/Editorial Vision (H)	Satisfactory	Good	Very Good	Excellent
A. Literary Quality (20 points): includes originality, variety, strength of ideas and themes. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Effective language, clarity, precision, expressiveness, sophistication, rhythm, musicality. • Masterful use of literary devices (i.e. metaphor, image, symbol). 	Some good writing, but quality may be inconsistent. Subject matter may lack sophistication and may become repetitive at times. (0-9 points)	A majority of the writing is good, but overall quality may be inconsistent. Writing is generally good for a middle school level. (10-13 points)	Outstanding writing. Subject matter avoids becoming trite. High quality writing for a middle school level. (14-17 points)	Outstanding writing. Masterful use of literary devices. Variety in the skills displayed in the writing. (18-20 points)
B. Variety of Genre (15 points): Poetry, narrative fiction, dramatic dialogue, personal essay, nonfiction writing (considering nonfiction texts from different subjects as their own discrete genres), translations, multimedia presentations (song lyrics, links to original student music, film, performance online), etc	Limited to 1 to 2 genres. (0-9 points)	Some genres (at least 3 distinct) represented. (10-11 pts.)	Many genres (at least 4 distinct) represented. (12-13 points)	Broad representation of genres (5+) and subject matter included. (14-15 points)
C. Variety of Voice (15 points): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Includes writing from many students – writing is not dominated by a few • Variety in perspectives representing variety in the school community 	Less variety of students represented. Little variety in perspectives. (0-9 points)	Variety of students represented. Some variety in perspectives. (10-11 points)	Writing by a wide variety of students represented. Significant variety in perspectives. (12-13 points)	Writing by a wide variety of students represented. Wide variety in perspectives. (14-15 points)
D. Artistic Quality (10 points): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Overall artistic quality. <p><small>NB: Any magazine that does not include artwork will not be penalized and will be graded on an 80-point scale.</small></p>	Some good artwork, but quality may be inconsistent. Subject matter may lack sophistication. (0-5 points)	Mostly high-quality artwork for a middle school level. Sophistication of artwork stands out in places (6-7 points)	Consistently high-quality artwork for a middle school level. Subject matter is distinct. High quality artwork for high school level. (8-9 points)	Outstanding artwork for a middle school level. Masterful use of different media and broad exploration of genres. (10 points)
E. Variety of Artistic Genre & Voice (10 points) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Variety in painting, digital art, photography, oil, sculpture, multimedia, etc. • Includes art from many students – artwork is not dominated by a few • Variety in perspectives representing variety in the school community <p><small>NB: Any magazine that does not include artwork will be graded on an 80-point scale</small></p>	Less variety of students represented. Little variety in perspectives. (0-5 points)	Variety of students represented. Some variety in perspectives. (6-7 points)	Artwork by a wide variety of students represented. Significant variety in perspectives. (8-9 points)	Artwork by a wide variety of students represented. Wide variety in perspectives. (10 points)

<p>F. Graphic Design and Layout (10 pts.)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Overall quality of the artistry of the magazine’s construction ● Effective layout and typography ● Effective use of art and design to complement writing. 	<p>Simplistic layout. Design may be cluttered or confusing or detract from the student work. Lacking coherence of theme/design.</p> <p>(0-5 points)</p>	<p>Pleasing layout. Art and design connect to writing.</p> <p>(6-7 points)</p>	<p>Layout adds to the overall effect of the magazine. Coherence of theme / design.</p> <p>(8-9 points)</p>	<p>Layout enhances magazine. Clear theme, coherent design.</p> <p>(10 points)</p>
<p>G. Editing & Proofreading (10 points)</p>	<p>Adequate editing but noticeable errors distract from writing. Students have a minor role in the process.</p> <p>(0-5 points)</p>	<p>Strong editing. Some errors. Students have a strong role in the editing process.</p> <p>(6-7 points)</p>	<p>Very strong editing. Few errors, if any. Students dominate the editing process.</p> <p>(8-9 points)</p>	<p>Meticulous editing and proofreading.</p> <p>(10 points)</p>
<p>H. Publication Conventions & Editorial Vision (10 points)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Informative front matter (Table of Contents...). ● Title page (title, school, city, district, state, date). ● Staff Credits, contact information ● Front Matter, Credits, Pagination ● Editorial Vision: Written expression of the editorial vision of the magazine clearly expressed. Letter from editors, selection criteria. A guiding theme is encouraged, not required 	<p>Incomplete and lacking information. Is hard to read. Student role is unclear.</p> <p>(0-5 points)</p>	<p>Mostly complete, accurate, and clear. Students have a strong role.</p> <p>(6-7 points)</p>	<p>Complete, accurate, and well-designed. Students dominate the process.</p> <p>(8-9 points)</p>	<p>Complete information, correct pagination. Well-designed. Students dominate the process.</p> <p>(10 points)</p>

First Class*: 90-100 points

Superior: 82-89 points

Excellent: 75-81 points

Distinguished: 68-74 points

Honorable Mention: 67 and below

*****Grading scale for magazines without artwork*****

First Class: 72-80 points

Superior: 67-71 points

Excellent: 60-66 points

Distinguished: 54-59 points

Honorable Mention: 53 and below

* This special award (REALM First Class) recognizes magazines that fulfill extraordinary standards of excellence. The magazine is characterized by a variety of genres including print and multimedia presentations, highly original and technically outstanding writing, high-quality design with fonts and graphics that complement the theme and tone, inclusion of high-quality writings from various disciplines, and other evidence that school-wide participation has gone into the development of the magazine. In such magazines, students handle virtually all aspects of writing, production, and business with exceptional skill. The REALM First Class honor may be given to several magazines in a particular year.

New Horizons Award: Award given to the highest-scoring magazines that are new to the REALM competition.